H. R. 11656

[Report No. 94-880]

IN THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

FEBRUARY 3, 1976

Ms. Abzug (for herself, Mr. Fascell, Mr. Brooks, Mr. Moss, Mr. Macdonald of Massachusetts, Mr. Moorhead of Pennsylvania, Mr. Rosenthal, Mr. Wright, Mr. Fuqua, Mr. Conyers, Mr. James V. Stanton, Ms. Collins of Illinois, Mr. John L. Burton, Mr. Harrington, Mr. Drinan, Mr. Mezvinsky, Ms. Jordan, Mr. Evans of Indiana, Mr. Moffett, Mr. Maguire, Mr. Aspin, Mr. Gude, Mr. McCloskey, Mr. Steelman, and Mr. Pritchard) introduced the following bill; which was referred to the Committee on Government Operations

March 8, 1976

Reported with amendments, referred to the Committee on the Judiciary for a period ending not later than April 8, 1976, for consideration of such provisions of the bill as fall within the jurisdiction of that committee under rule X, clause (1) (m), and ordered to be printed

[Insert the part printed in italic]

A BILL

To provide that meetings of Government agencies shall be open to the public, and for other purposes.

- 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
- 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
- 3 That this Act may be cited as the "Government in the
- 4 Sunshine Act".
- 5 DECLARATION OF POLICY
- 6 Sec. 2. It is hereby declared to be the policy of the
- 7 United States that the public is entitled to the fullest prac-

- 1 ticable information regarding the decisionmaking processes
- 2 of the Federal Government. It is the purpose of this Act
- 3 to provide the public with such information while protecting
- 4 the rights of individuals and the ability of the Government
- 5 to carry out its responsibilities.
- 6 OPEN MEETINGS
- 7 SEC. 3. (a) Title 5, United States Code, is amended
- 8 by adding after section 552a the following new section:
- 9 "§ 552b. Open meetings
- 10 "(a) For purposes of this section—
- "(1) the term 'agency' means the Federal Election
- 12 Commission and any agency, as defined in section 552
- (e) of this title, headed by a collegial body composed of
- 14 two or more individual members, a majority of whom
- are appointed to such position by the President with
- the advice and consent of the Senate, and includes any
- subdivision thereof authorized to act on behalf of the
- 18 agency;
- "(2) the term 'meeting' means the deliberations of
- at least the number of individual agency members re-
- 21 quired to take action on behalf of the agency where such
- deliberations concern the joint conduct or disposition of
- agency business; and
- 24 "(3) the term 'member' means an individual who
- belongs to a collegial body heading an agency.

1	"(b) Except as provided in subsection (c), every por-
2	tion of every meeting of an agency shall be open to public
3	observation.
4	"(c) Except in a case where the agency finds that the
5	public interest requires otherwise, subsection (b) shall
6	not apply to any portion of an agency meeting and the
7	requirements of subsections (d) and (e) shall not apply to
8	any information pertaining to such meeting otherwise re-
9	quired by this section to be disclosed to the public, where the
10	agency properly determines that such portion or portions of
11	its meeting or the disclosure of such information is likely to-
12	"(1) disclose matters (A) specifically authorized
13	under criteria established by an Executive order to be
14	kept secret in the interests of national defense or foreign
15	policy and (B) in fact properly classified pursuant to
16	such Executive order;
17	"(2) relate solely to the internal personnel rules
18	and practices of an agency;
19	"(3) disclose information required to be withheld
20	from the public by any statute establishing particular
21	criteria or referring to particular types of information;
22	"(4) disclose trade secrets and commercial or finan-
23	cial information obtained from a person and privileged or
24	confidential;

1	*	".(5) involve	accusing	any	person	of	a	crime,	or
2^{\cdot}		formally	censuring	any perso	n;				·	•

. 14

- "(6) disclose information of a personal nature where disclosure would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy;
- "(7) disclose investigatory records compiled for law enforcement purposes, but only to the extent that the production of such records would (A) interfere with enforcement proceedings, (B) deprive a person of a right to a fair trial or an impartial adjudication, (C) constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy, (D) disclose the identity of a confidential source and, in the case of a record compiled by a criminal law enforcement authority in the course of a criminal investigation, or by an agency conducting a lawful national security intelligence investigation, confidential information furnished only by the confidential source, (E) disclose investigative techniques and procedures, or (F) endanger the life or physical safety of law enforcement personnel;
- "(8) disclose information contained in or related to examination, operating, or condition reports prepared by, on behalf of, or for the use of an agency responsible for the regulation or supervision of financial institutions;

1	"(9) disclose information the premature disclosure
2	of which would—
3	"(A) in the case of an agency which regulates
4	currencies, securities, commodities, or financial in
5	stitutions, be likely to (i) lead to significant financia
6	speculation, or (ii) significantly endanger the sta-
7	bility of any financial institution; or
8	"(B) in the case of any agency, be likely to
9	significantly frustrate implementation of a proposed
10	agency action, except that this subparagraph shall
1	not apply in any instance where the content or na-
12	ture of the proposed agency action already has been
1.3	disclosed to the public by the agency, or where the
4	agency is required by law to make such disclosure
15	prior to taking final agency action on such proposal
16	or
L 7	"(10) specifically concern the agency's issuance
18.	of a subpena, or the agency's participation in a civi
19	action, an action in a foreign court or international tri-
20	bunal, or an arbitration, or the initiation, conduct, or
21	disposition by the agency of a particular case of forma
22	agency adjudication pursuant to the procedures in section

554 of this title or otherwise involving a determination

on the record after opportunity for a hearing.

23

24

"(d) (1) Action under subsection (c) to close a portion or portions of an agency meeting shall be taken only when a majority of the entire membership of the agency votes to take such action. A separate vote of the agency members shall be taken with respect to each agency meeting a portion or portions of which are proposed to be closed to the public pursuant to subsection (c), or with respect to any 7 information which is proposed to be withheld under subsection (c). A single vote may be taken with respect to a series of portions of meetings which are proposed to be 10 closed to the public, or with respect to any information con-11 cerning such series, so long as each portion of a meeting 12 13 in such series involves the same particular matters, and is scheduled to be held no more than thirty days after the 15 initial portion of a meeting in such series. The vote of each 16 agency member participating in such vote shall be recorded 17 and no proxies shall be allowed.

"(2) Whenever any person whose interests may be directly affected by a portion of a meeting requests that the agency close such portion to the public for any of the reasons referred to in paragraph (5), (6), or (7) of subsection (c), the agency, upon request of any one of its members, shall vote by recorded vote whether to close such meeting.

"(3) Within one day of any vote taken pursuant to paragraph (1) or (2), the agency shall make publicly

- 1 available a written copy of such vote reflecting the vote of
- 2 each member on the question. If a portion of a meeting is
- 3 to be closed to the public, the agency shall, within one day
- 4 of the vote taken pursuant to paragraph (1) or (2) of this
- 5 subsection, make publicly available a full written explana-
- 6 tion of its action closing the portion together with a list of
- 7 all persons expected to attend the meeting and their
- 8 affiliation.
- 9 "(4) Any agency, a majority of the portions of whose
- 10 meetings may properly be closed to the public pursuant to
- 11 paragraph (4), (8), (9) (A), or (10) of subsection (c),
- 12 or any combination thereof, may provide by regulation for
- 13 the closing of such portions in the event that a majority of
- 14 the members of the agency votes by recorded vote at the
- 15 beginning of such meeting, or portion thereof, to close the
- 16 exempt portion or portions of the meeting, and a copy of
- 17 such vote, reflecting the vote of each member on the ques-
- 18 tion, is made available to the public. The provisions of para-
- 19 graphs (1), (2), and (3) of this subsection and subsection
- 20 (e) shall not apply to any portion of a meeting to which
- 21 such regulations apply: Provided, That the agency shall,
- 22 except to the extent that such information is exempt from
- 23 disclosure under the provisions of subsection (c), provide
- 24 the public with public announcement of the date, place, and
- 25 subject matter of the meeting and each portion thereof at

- 1 the earliest practicable time and in no case later than the
- 2 commencement of the meeting or portion in question.
- 3 "(e) In the case of each meeting, the agency shall make
- 4 public announcement, at least one week before the meeting,
- 5 of the date, place, and subject matter of the meeting, whether
- 6 it is to be open or closed to the public, and the name and
- 7 phone number of the official designated by the agency to
- 8 respond to requests for information about the meeting. Such
- 9 announcement shall be made unless a majority of the mem-
- 10 bers of the agency determines by a recorded vote that agency
- 11 business requires that such meeting be called at an earlier
- 12 date, in which case the agency shall make public announce-
- 13 ment of the date, place, and subject matter of such meeting,
- 14 and whether open or closed to the public, at the earliest
- 15 practicable time and in no case later than the commence-
- 16 ment of the meeting or portion in question. The time, place,
- 17 or subject matter of a meeting, or the determination of the
- 18 agency to open or close a meeting, or portion of a meeting,
- 19 to the public, may be changed following the public announce-
- 20 ment required by this paragraph only if (1) a majority of
- 21 the entire membership of the agency determines by a re-
- 22 corded vote that agency business so requires and that no
- 23 earlier announcement of the change was possible, and (2)
- 24 the agency publicly announces such change and the vote
- 25 of each member upon such change at the earliest practicable

- time and in no case later than the commencement of themeeting or portion in question.
- "(f) (1) A complete transcript or electronic recording 3 adequate to record fully the proceedings shall be made of each 4 meeting, or portion of a meeting, closed to the public, ex-5 cept for a meeting, or portion of a meeting, closed to the 6 public pursuant to paragraph (10) of subsection (c). The 7 agency shall make promptly available to the public, in a 8 location easily accessible to the public, the complete transcript 9 or electronic recording of the discussion at such meeting of 10 any item on the agenda, or of the testimony of any witness 11 received at such meeting, except for such portion or portions 12 of such discussion or testimony as the agency, by recorded 13 14 vote taken subsequent to the meeting and promptly made 15 available to the public, determines to contain information 16 specified in paragraphs (1) through (10) of subsection (c). 17 In place of each portion deleted from such a transcript or 18 transcription the agency shall supply a written explanation of the reason for the deletion, and the portion of subsection 19 20 (c) and any other statute said to permit the deletion. Copies of such transcript, or a transcription of such electronic re-21 22 cording disclosing the identity of each speaker, shall be fur-23 nished to any person at no greater than the actual cost of duplication or transcription or, if in the public interest, at 24 no cost. The agency shall maintain a complete verbatim 25

- 1 copy of the transcript, or a complete electronic recording of
- 2 each meeting, or portion of a meeting, closed to the public,
- 3 for a period of at least two years after such meeting,
- 4 or until one year after the conclusion of any agency pro-
- 5 ceeding with respect to which the meeting, or a portion
- 6 thereof, was held, whichever occurs later.
- 7 "(2) Written minutes shall be made of any agency meet-
- 8 ing, or portion thereof, which is open to the public. The
- 9 agency shall make such minutes promptly available to the
- 10 public in a location easily accessible to the public, and shall
- 11 maintain such minutes for a period of at least two years after
- 12 such meeting. Copies of such minutes shall be furnished to
- 13 any person at no greater than the actual cost of duplication
- 14 thereof or, if in the public interest, at no cost.
- "(g) Each agency subject to the requirements of this
- 16 section shall, within 180 days after the date of enactment
- 17 of this section, following consultation with the Office of the
- 18 Chairman of the Administrative Conference of the United
- 19 States and published notice in the Federal Register of at
- 20 least thirty days and opportunity for written comment by
- 21 any persons, promulgate regulations to implement the re-
- 22 quirements of subsections (b) through (f) of this section.
- 23 Any person may bring a proceeding in the United States
- 24 District Court for the District of Columbia to require an
- 25 agency to promulgate such regulations if such agency has.

1 not promulgated such regulations within the time period

2 specified herein. Subject to any limitations of time therefor

3 provided by law, any person may bring a proceeding in

4 the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Colum-

5 bia to set aside agency regulations issued pursuant to this

6 subsection that are not in accord with the requirements of

7 subsections (b) through (f) of this section, and to require

8 the promulgation of regulations that are in accord with such

9 subsections.

25

"(h) The district courts of the United States have juris-10 diction to enforce the requirements of subsections 11 through (f) of this section. Such actions may be brought by 12 13 any person against an agency or its members prior to, or within sixty days after, the meeting out of which the viola-14 tion of this section arises, except that if public announce-15 ment of such meeting is not initially provided by the 16 17 agency in accordance with the requirements of this section, 18 such action may be instituted pursuant to this section at any time prior to sixty days after any public announcement of 19 such meeting. Such actions may be brought in the district 20 wherein the plaintiff resides, or has his principal place of 21 business, or where the agency in question has its headquar-2223 ters. In such actions a defendant shall serve his answer within twenty days after the service of the complaint, but 24

such time may be extended by the court for up to twenty

additional days upon a showing of good cause therefor. The 1 burden is on the defendant to sustain his action. In deciding 2 such cases the court may examine in camera any portion of 3 a transcript or electronic recording of a meeting closed to the 4. public, and may take such additional evidence as it deems 5 necessary. The court, having due regard for orderly administration and the public interest, as well as the interests of the 7 party, may grant such equitable relief as it deems appro-8 priate, including granting an injunction against future viola-9 tions of this section, or ordering the agency to make available 10 to the public such portion of the transcript or electronic 11 recording of a meeting as is not authorized to be withheld 12 under subsection (c) of this section. Except to the extent 13 provided in subsection (i) of this section, nothing in this sec-14 tion confers jurisdiction on any district court acting solely 15 under this subsection to set aside, enjoin or invalidate any 16 agency action taken or discussed at an agency meeting out 17 of which the violation of this section arose. 18

"(i) Any Federal court otherwise authorized by law to review agency action may, at the application of any person properly participating in the judicial review proceeding, inquire into violations by the agency of the requirements of this section and afford any such relief as it deems appropriate.

19

20

21

22

23

"(j) The court may assess against any party reasonable attorney fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred by

- 1 any other party who substantially prevails in any action
- 2 brought in accordance with the provisions of subsection (g),
- 3 (h), or (i) of this section, except that costs may be assessed
- 4 against an individual member of an agency only in the case
- 5 where the court finds such agency member has intentionally
- 6 and repeatedly violated this section and against the plaintiff
- 7 only where the court finds that the suit was initiated by the
- 8 plaintiff primarily for frivolous or dilatory purposes. In the
- 9 case of assessment of costs against an agency, the costs may
- 10 be assessed by the court against the United States.
- "(k) Each agency subject to the requirements of this
- 12 section shall annually report to Congress regarding its com-
- 13 pliance with such requirements, including a tabulation of the
- 14 total number of agency meetings open to the public, the
- 15 total number of meetings closed to the public, the reasons
- 16 for closing such meetings, and a description of any litigation
- 17 brought against the agency under this section, including any
- 18 costs assessed against the agency in such litigation (whether
- 19 or not paid by the agency).
- 20 "(1) Except as specifically provided in this section,
- 21 nothing herein expands or limits the present rights of any
- 22 person under section 552 of this title, except that the pro-
- 23 visions of this Act shall govern in the case of any request
- 24 made pursuant to such section to copy or inspect the tran-
- 25 scripts or electronic recordings described in subsection (f)

- 1 of this section. The requirements of chapter 33 of title 44,
- 2 United States Code, shall not apply to the transcripts and
- 3 electronic recordings described in subsection (f) of this
- 4 section.
- 5 "(m) This section does not constitute authority to with-
- 6 hold any information from Congress, and does not authorize
- 7 the closing of any agency meeting or portion thereof other-
- 8 wise required by law to be open.
- 9 "(n) Nothing in this section authorizes any agency
- 10 to withhold from any individual any record, including tran-
- 11 scripts or electronic recordings required by this Act, which
- 12 is otherwise accessible to such individual under section 552a
- 13 of this title.
- "(0) In the event that any meeting is subject to the pro-
- 15 visions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act as well as
- 16 the provisions of this section, the provisions of this section
- shall govern.".
- 18 (b) The chapter analysis of chapter 5 of title 5,
- 19 United States Code, is amended by inserting:

"552b. Open meetings."

20 immediately below:

"552a. Records about individuals.".

- 21 EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS
- SEC. 4. (a) Section 557 of title 5, United States Code,

1 is amended by adding at the end thereof the following	new
---	-----

- 2 subsection:
- 3 "(d) (1) In any agency proceeding which is subject to
- 4 subsection (a) of this section, except to the extent required
- 5 for the disposition of exparte matters as authorized by law—
- 6 "(A) no interested person outside the agency shall
- 7 make or cause to be made to any member of the body
- 8 comprising the agency, administrative law judge, or
- 9 other employee who is or may reasonably be expected
- to be involved in the decisional process of the proceed-
- ing, an ex parte communication relative to the merits
- of the proceeding;
- "(B) no member of the body comprising the agen-
- cy, administrative law judge, or other employee who
- is or may reasonably be expected to be involved in
- the decisional process of the proceeding, shall make or
- cause to be made to any interested person outside the
- agency an ex parte communication relative to the merits
- of the proceeding;
- "(C) a member of the body comprising the agency,
- administrative law judge, or other employee who is or
- 22 may reasonably be expected to be involved in the de-
- cisional process of such proceeding who receives, or
- 24 who makes or causes to be made, a communication pro-

1 hibited by this subsection shall	place on the public record
2 of the proceeding:	the state of the state of
3 "(i) all such written c	ommunications;
4 "(ii) memoranda sta	ting the substance of all
5 such oral communications;	and
6 "(iii) all written res	ponses, and memoranda
7 stating the substance of a	ll oral responses, to the
8 materials described in clau	uses (i) and (ii) of this
9 subparagraph;	the state of the s
"(D) in the event of a c	communication prohibited
by this subsection and made or	caused to be made by a
party or interested person, th	e agency, administrative
law judge, or other employee	presiding at the hearing
may, to the extent consistent w	ith the interests of justice
and the policy of the underly	ing statutes, require the
person or party to show cause	why his claim or interest
in the proceeding should not be	pe dismissed, denied, dis-
regarded, or otherwise adverse	ly affected on account of
such violation; and	
"(E) the prohibitions of t	his subsection shall apply
beginning at such time as the	e agency may designate,
but in no case shall they begin	n to apply later than the
time at which a proceeding is a	noticed for hearing unless
the person responsible for the c	ommunication has knowl-
edge that it will be noticed, in	which case the prohibi-

1	tions shall apply beginning at the time of his acquisition
2	of such knowledge.
3	"(2) This section does not constitute authority to with-
4	hold information from Congress.".
5	(b) Section 551 of title 5, United States Code, is
6	amended—
7	(1) by striking out "and" at the end of paragraph
8	(12);
9	(2) by striking out the "act." at the end of para-
10	graph (13) and inserting in lieu thereof "act; and";
11	and
12	(3) by adding at the end thereof the following new
13	paragraph:
14	"(14) 'ex parte communication' means an oral or
15	written communication not on the public record with
16	respect to which reasonable prior notice to all parties
17	is not given.".
18	(c) Section 556 (d) of title 5, United States Code, is
19	amended by inserting between the third and fourth sentences
20	thereof the following new sentence: "The agency may, to
21	the extent consistent with the interests of justice and the
22	policy of the underlying statutes administered by the agency,
23	consider a violation of section 557 (d) of this title sufficient
24	grounds for a decision adverse to a person or party who has
25	committed such violation or caused such violation to occur.".

1	CONFORMING AMENDMENTS
2	SEC. 5. (a) Section 410 (b) (1) of title 39, United
3	States Code, is amended by inserting after "Section 552
4	(public information)," the words "section 552a (records
5	about individuals), section 552b (open meetings),".
6	(b) Section 552 (b) (3) of title 5, United States Code,
7	is amended to read as follows:
8	"(3) required to be withheld from the public by
9	any statute establishing particular criteria or referring
10	to particular types of information;".
11	EFFECTIVE DATE
12	SEC. 6. (a) Except as provided in subsection (b) of
13	this section, the provisions of this Act shall take effect one
14	hundred and eighty days after the date of its enactment.
15	(b) Subsection (g) of section 552b of title 5, United
16	States Code, as added by section 3 (a) of this Act, shall take
17	effect upon enactment.

H. R. 11656

[Report No. 94-880]

A BILL

To provide that meetings of Government agencies shall be open to the public, and for other purposes.

By Ms. Abzug, Mr. Fascell, Mr. Brooks, Mr. Moss, Mr. Macdonald of Massachusetts, Mr. Moorhead of Pennsylvania, Mr. Rosenthal, Mr. Wright, Mr. Fuqua, Mr. Conyers, Mr. James V. Stanton, Ms. Collins of Illinois, Mr. John L. Burton, Mr. Harrington, Mr. Drinan, Mr. Mezvinsky, Ms. Jordan, Mr. Evans of Indiana, Mr. Moffett, Mr. Maguire, Mr. Aspin, Mr. Gude, Mr. McCloskey, Mr. Steelman, and Mr. Pritchard

FEBRUARY 3, 1976

Referred to the Committee on Government Operations

MARCH 8, 1976

Reported with amendments, referred to the Committee on the Judiciary for a period ending not later than April 8, 1976, for consideration of such provisions of the bill as fall within the jurisdiction of that committee under rule X, clause (1)(m), and ordered to be printed